

A&WMA Critical Review Committee

CHARTER AND MANUAL OF OPERATIONS

Revised: April 26, 2017

Section 1. Mission Statement

1.1. Critical Review Committee Mission: The mission of the A&WMA Critical Review Committee (CRC) is to develop and oversee the Annual A&WMA Critical Review paper and presentation. (A complete list of past A&WMA Critical Reviews, dating back to 1971, is appended to this Charter.) The Annual A&WMA Critical Review Presentation Session is a key part of the Association's Annual Conference Technical Program, perhaps second only in importance and popularity to the opening Plenary Session. Often, the Review topic dovetails into the Annual Conference theme and sets a tone for relevant technical sessions. A&WMA Critical Reviews are scientifically important, have a high impact, and provide extended visibility of the Association's activities to industry, regulators, and the scientific community. The Annual A&WMA Critical Review paper is published in the June issue of the *Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association (JA&WMA)*, one of the oldest continuously published, peer-reviewed, technical environmental journals in the world. A synthesis of comments and critiques is published as a Discussion Paper in the October issue of *JA&WMA*.

Section 2. Membership

2.1. Critical Review Committee Membership: Committee membership shall be drawn from the at-large A&WMA membership, representing the Association's diverse technical topic areas. The main criteria for membership are fulfillment of responsibilities and participation in activities of the CRC.

Committee members' Association membership should be current and in good standing. Members should have proven publication track records and be respected in their fields; prior experience with publishing peer-review papers is desired. The Association will strive to enlist members with regulatory, policy, technical, or business experience from government (e.g., federal, state, or local agencies), industry, consulting, or academic organizations, and from both the air and waste communities.

2.1. Committee Officers: Officers of the CRC are the Chair and Vice Chair. The Chair provides leadership in coordinating the CRC discussion and in preparing the final manuscript, assisted by the Vice Chair.

2.2. Voting Members: The CRC shall have at least 12 and no more than 20 voting members, including the Chair, Vice Chair, and a liaison to the Technical Council. The CRC liaison to the Technical Council is a vital position in communicating and coordinating between the two entities and with the A&WMA Annual Conference Local Host Committee.

Section 3. Membership Terms

3.1. Three-Year Term: Committee members shall serve three-year terms, staggered so that roughly one-third of member terms will expire in a given year. Terms for members and officers begin at the Committee's annual meeting, held in conjunction with A&WMA's Annual Conference & Exhibition. Chair and Vice Chair rotation shall occur at the close of the Committee's annual meeting.

3.2. Additional Terms: Committee members may serve additional terms, upon recommendation and approval by the Committee. The departing Chair remains a voting member of the Committee for an additional year ("Past Chair"), and may serve subsequent terms as a member upon approval by the Committee.

Section 4. Responsibilities

4.1. The CRC: The CRC is responsible for:

- 4.1.1.** Selecting topics, authors, and discussants on an annual basis.
- 4.1.2.** Providing guidance to CR authors and discussants.
- 4.1.3.** Providing timely, constructive review of draft manuscripts prior to publication in *JA&WMA*.
- 4.1.4.** Attending the Annual A&WMA Critical Review Presentation in person, and offering additional comments for inclusion in the Discussion Paper.
- 4.1.5.** Promoting the Annual A&WMA Critical Review to colleagues and associates.

Section 5. Annual Critical Review Schedule

5.1. Critical Review Schedule: Authors and topics should be selected no less than one year out from publication of the full-length Review Paper.

5.2. Typical Critical Review Schedule: A typical schedule for the Critical Review process is:

- **MAY 31:** Author(s) provide proposed Review title and detailed outline for consideration by the Critical Review Committee during its annual meeting in June.
- **SEPTEMBER 1:** Author(s) confirm paper title, author(s), and outline for use as promotional information on the Association's website and in conference materials.
- **JANUARY 5:** Author(s) submit draft manuscript via ScholarOne, the *JA&WMA*'s online manuscript submittal system, for review by the Critical Review Committee. The target length for the Review is 30 printed pages in *JA&WMA*, or approximately 60 double-spaced manuscript pages.
- **JANUARY 5:** The Committee Chair recruits three to five representatives from public and private sectors as discussants for the Critical Review Presentation.
- **FEBRUARY 5:** The Critical Review Committee (the reviewers) forward comments to author(s) via ScholarOne.
- **MARCH 1:** Author(s) submit revised second draft manuscript via ScholarOne for final review by the Critical Review Committee.
- **MARCH 15:** Author(s) submit revised (FINAL) manuscript for publication via ScholarOne.
- **APRIL 15:** Author(s) submit four-page summary of Review (of no more than 2,000 words), which is to be published in *EM Magazine* (*JA&WMA*'s sister publication).
- **JUNE:** The full-length Critical Review and summary article are published in the June issues of *JA&WMA* and *EM*, respectively.
- **JUNE:** Author participates in a three-hour (9:00 – 11:45 a.m.) Critical Review Session during A&WMA's Annual Conference & Exhibition. The Critical Review Session typically includes a 45-minute presentation by the author, 15-minute presentations from each invited discussant, and an open floor discussion.

- **JULY:** The Critical Review Committee Chair prepares a summary of the Critical Review discussion and assembles the discussants' written comments. The author(s) will be provided a copy of the discussion article, so they may include responses to the discussants' contributions in this summary.
- **JULY 31:** The Critical Review Committee Chair submits the Critical Review Discussion Paper via ScholarOne.
- **OCTOBER:** The Critical Review Discussion Paper is published in the October issue of *JA&WMA*.

Section 6. A&WMA Sponsorship and Honorarium

6.1. JA&WMA Page Charges: A&WMA covers the cost of page charges for the Critical Review Introduction (authored by the Critical Review Committee Chair) and the first 30 printed pages of the Review itself. A&WMA also covers the cost of up to three figures that are color-dependent and must be reproduced in color in *JA&WMA*.

6.2. A&WMA Sponsorship: A&WMA provides the nominated Critical Review Author/Presenter with a full conference registration; reasonable travel costs associated with the author's participation in the Critical Review Presentation Session; and hotel room and tax expense for up to two nights stay at the annual conference hotel.

6.3. Honorarium: In recognition of the Critical Review author(s) contributions to the program, the Association provides an honorarium of \$1,000, which is presented at the Annual Conference.

A complete list of past Critical Reviews is available [online](#).